# **CORRECTED VERSION**

## ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE

#### Inquiry into the Viability of the Victorian Thoroughbred/Standardbred Breeding Industries

Melbourne — 22 August 2005

#### Members

Mr B. J. Jenkins Mr N. F. Pullen Mr A. G. Robinson

Chair: Mr A. G. Robinson

<u>Staff</u>

Executive Officer: Dr R. Solomon Research Officer: Ms K. Newitt Office Manager: Ms A. Agosta

Witness

Dr N. Roe, Director, Horse Business Management Program, Marcus Oldham College.

**The CHAIR** — The Committee welcomes Nick Roe to our hearing this afternoon. Nick is the Director of the Horse Business Management program at Marcus Oldham College. For the record, the Committee is going to visit Marcus Oldham on Wednesday. We welcome your presence and your contribution. As you know, the committee is an all-party committee of the Parliament of Victoria. We have been asked to investigate and report back to the Parliament on the viability of the standardbred and thoroughbred breeding industry. We have spoken to a large number of people, made a number of site visits and gathered a fair bit of evidence formally and informally. Your evidence today is formal evidence so it is being transcribed by Hansard staff, who will produce a formal set of minutes which we will be able to correct in a couple of weeks' time. We will also give you that opportunity. Your comments today are covered by parliamentary privilege so anything you say cannot be used by others legally against you, but that privilege only extends for the duration of this hearing. If you go out the door, you are on your own. We do not expect that you need to worry about that, but we do need to point it out to you that because it is an open hearing the media come in occasionally and take notes. You need to be careful of anything you might say in that regard. To start off with we might invite you to give some background on Marcus Oldham — we know it has been going for some time — and then we will fire some questions at you.

**Dr ROE** — First of all, Marcus Oldham College has been running a horse business management course since 1979 — 25 years. It is a private, not-for-profit college and was set up by a bequest from Mr Marcus Oldham. The money was used to buy the 200-hectare property just out of Geelong. Admittedly it was set up for the education of the sons of Protestant farmers, which was changed before 1979 so that we could educate horse people as well. We also run an Associate Diploma in Rural Business Management, a Bachelor of Business (Rural Management) and a Diploma in Agribusiness. We have between 25 to 36 horse course enrolments a year. We lose one or two a year who do not pass. There is a chance for those who struggle with the tougher subjects to graduate with a Certificate IV in horse business management. It is a pretty intensive course. They come in in the second week of February and leave in the second week of December. It is \$27 000 a year, which covers their education, \$5500 of which goes towards two tours — one tour of the Hunter Valley and one tour of the North Island of New Zealand — and another \$5500 goes to food and accommodation. All text books, et cetera, are supplied. We have anywhere from 4 to 12 overseas students a year from a variety of areas — for example, South Africa, Canada, Noumea. There are four from Singapore this year and we had four from Hong Kong a couple of years ago. There is one from Malaysia just about every year. The Malaysian Equine Council sponsors one to come every year.

I am a qualified veterinary surgeon. I did equine vet practice for four years. I have been a competitive rider in eventing and showjumping for a long time. I rode in an eventing world cup final in France in 2003. I have a certificate IV in workplace training and assessment, and I recently got a diploma in racing from Wangaratta. I received my owner/trainer licence in the gallopers in February, so I have seven in work at the moment. Des Ryan works with me. He is also a racehorse trainer.

## The CHAIR — Where do you get the time?

**Dr ROE** — I do not sleep much, and my wife works very hard. She backs me up. She is a vet as well, and a very good organiser. Des Ryan is also a racehorse open trainer. He has also previously trained standardbred horses. Cassandra Houtsma is more equestrian based; she has an NTIS level 1 coaching certificate. Both Des and Cassandra are graduates of the college. We employ a lot of outside lecturers. Ballarat Veterinary Practice comes down a lot, and we use a lot of sessionals, such as Angus McKinnon, for 8 hours of breeding. The course covers three main areas. Roughly 30 per cent is practical skills: foal handling, weanling handling, yearling prep, a little bit of breaking — that kind of stuff — and there is a little bit of riding for those who are interested. We took six down to do the RVL track riders course this year. There is 30 per cent horse husbandry with two veterinary modules, a little bit of farriery, nutrition, exercise physiology, stud management, and then 30 per cent is core business — fundamental business subjects.

Due to the logistics of sending students out for foaling, weaning, handling and that kind of stuff, we started breeding when I started at the college. I started at the college in 2001, was made Director in 2002 and I brought breeding, weaning and breaking-in back on to campus because we were having trouble with facilities and outside lecturers and that kind of thing. We breed five foals a year which we then do a weaning and handling session on, and a yearling handling, then break them in as two-year-olds. Students also do three weeks of stud placement at this time of year after their New Zealand tour and two weeks industry placement in that part of the industry they choose.

Of our graduates, probably about 30 to 50 per cent, depending on the year, end up working in the thoroughbred breeding sector. Of the others, some go on to do other courses, probably about 10 per cent; a lot work in the equestrian world as well and a lot go into trainers' stables as foremen, stable hands, track riders and that kind of stuff. We aim at producing middle management and above-type people or people who can run their own business as far as dealing in horses or bloodstock agents or those kinds of things. The College at the moment is looking to develop its facilities; it has been there for 25 years and is getting a little run down. With my introduction of the on-site breeding program we need to bring our facilities up to standard. We have got plenty of land, we are getting built around us, depending on where the ring road goes, but we are there for the long term as such.

**The CHAIR** — What is the biggest single problem in the breeding industry from your perspective, because you have got a combination of interesting perspectives; what do you think is the greatest need in the industry in Victoria?

**Dr ROE** — The greatest need is to keep breeding Elvstroems. Internationally the thoroughbred industry is booming and we need to make sure we keep up. The way to keep up is to keep producing Group 1-winning racehorses. As far as our graduates are concerned — the students we produce — they are in hot demand. If I had 20 more graduates sitting in my back pocket tomorrow they would all have jobs. Meeting the demand for good, educated, hands-on, half-smart workers — there is a lot of demand for them out there. From my point of view where I sit, meeting that demand, for us to get enough people to come in the door is probably a big problem.

The CHAIR — You do not have much trouble filling the spots in your courses each year?

**Dr ROE** — If we had demand to have 40 suitable graduates we would increase production, so to speak. We would split into two: equestrian, and racing breeding or thoroughbred, much earlier. The trouble is finding enough students with \$27 000 to come. We are lucky in the sense that anyone who spends \$27 000 is pretty committed so we have a good completion rate as such. We have hovered around those numbers for quite a while. We get down towards 25 when the international scene is quiet and we get up around 36 when there is more of that. Why we have not grown with the industry I am not sure, I keep asking my bosses the same thing. Whether it is a lack of facilities or whether we have not tapped into various markets like we should have, I do not know.

**The CHAIR** — Your graduates are those that are based in Victoria to begin with. Typically do they find work in Victoria, or do most of them end up outside Victoria, up in the Hunter Valley?

**Dr ROE** — In the Hunter Valley. We do have a few on studs in Victoria, and as you were talking about earlier, it is a pretty mobile sort of job. We have them linking up with big organisations and then they move around, whether it is in the Hunter Valley or around Euroa or over in Ireland or America; it is pretty mobile. As far as specifically staying in Victoria, probably about 25 per cent do. Of the ones who work in the breeding industry we would lose out of the state probably about 75 per cent.

**The CHAIR** — It is interesting that effectively Victorians are subsidising the industry interstate in a sense. We are providing — —

**Dr ROE** — Yes. We are pretty independent as far as funding goes. We do not receive any funding so we rely solely on the \$27 000.

**The CHAIR** — I want to pick your brain on one question, wearing your hat as a qualified vet and also as a trainer.

Dr ROE — As a new trainer!

**The CHAIR** — I will run this past you. The horse industry — the thoroughbred racing industry at least — is capital intensive. The horses wear out. It suffers all sorts of wastage along the way. In a paddock of 100 broodmares, in any given season you might get 90 of them in foal if you are lucky. Of that 90 you might end up with 65 that actually deliver a foal the next year and of that you might end up with about 50 that actually have good conformation and are capable of going on. Then in a year's time when they are ready for the two-year-old season you might have 40 that are actually ready to race and you might end up with 20 that win a race out of the 100.

**Dr ROE** — You would be doing really well, I would think.

**The CHAIR** — That is huge, for a livestock industry, huge inbuilt wastage. If the industry is all about breeding horses that can measure up to performing on the race track and 80 out of 100 do not even get there, that 80 represents a phenomenal wastage of investment — that is literally wastage?

## Dr ROE — Yes.

**The CHAIR** — Things that you see as a vet — you see them in the way horses are reared, you see them in the way horses are managed and the way trainers look after them and rear them to try to produce some early form — is that accentuating the wastage? Are there things we are doing that is accelerating that wastage?

**Dr ROE** — It is all looking into a crystal ball. When a racehorse breaks down, if it is a filly it goes to stud; if a stallion wins four from four, or five from five, and then breaks down, it goes to stud and will probably have a full book of mares. As far as genetics or a breeding cattle perspective you would not breed from them. Whether speed and breaking down has a direct correlation, the faster they go the more likely they are to break from a training point of view. My slow ones do not break down and the ones that I get excited about do. That would be one thing from a scientific point of view to go back to various stallions that did break down, or various broodmares that did not have, say, over six racing starts and do a retrospective study on that — that would be interesting to see whether their offspring produced more horses that were able to compete repeatedly at a high level. As far as feeding, raising and handling goes, no; the amount of money, time and skill that is put into rearing and producing those horses is pretty amazing. I think our standards of handling, rearing, feeding and the thought that goes into that is pretty good. I would be interested in the genetic side of failing at the race track.

Mr PULLEN — Where do you train? Do you train at the track?

**Dr ROE** — I certainly involve the students as such. My wife and I bought 170 acres just out of Geelong. I truck them to the track two or three mornings a week and I have got a sand track at home, a pretty basic sort of sand track. Des Ryan is in charge of the thoroughbred unit as such and he trains three at the college, and one ran third at Geelong last Thursday — Running Hot — so the students are actively involved in the training process with those. I just use a couple for track riders; I am a bit too heavy once we get going fast.

**Mr JENKINS** — On the units in the course — the Australian breeding industry and its structure and regulations; and the role of the Australian Stud Book — do they include sections of how they can be fixed or made better or what works about them and what does not?

Dr ROE — No.

Mr JENKINS — Could they?

**Dr ROE** — Possibly. I am probably not the best qualified to discuss that and it depends which way you are angling. Des Ryan, who could not attend today because they are on a tour of South Australia — I think they are at Lindsay Park today — is probably the best one to talk about that, seeing he lectures the subject.

**The CHAIR** — Let me ask you to think about hobby trainers. One of the characteristics of the Victorian breeding industry is that we have a large number of hobbyists and that is, I think, seen to be in many respects a strength because often the next-day champion is reared by or produced by people who but for the fact they are hobbyists would never have made that decision. It is also a weakness in a sense because typically hobby breeders are undercapitalised. Often, as we heard from our first witness today, Bob Scarborough, typically they might get into it because they raced a filly, it might have broken down so they decide to breed from it and it is lowest common denominator all the way through. They wonder why they cannot get a good price for the yearling at the sales. Do you see common mistakes — made by hobby breeders — in your practice and is it commonly a mistake for example that people get into breeding because the horse they wanted to race cannot race any longer so they decide to breed, or they end up vice versa — that is, they try to breed but cannot sell the horse so end up racing it? Do people make in some respects poor judgment on these things?

**Dr ROE** — Genetically, yes in my opinion, not that I am a genetics expert. It is all at a level of how much you have to spend. I am looking around at service fees at the moment, at the \$2000 to \$4000 level, and that is a big strength in the Victorian industry. We have got horses at that level that have run second in a Golden Slipper and produced stakes-winning horses, so we are lucky that way. I would see that as a definite strength. I see

professionals make mistakes too in their breeding so I would not just class it as hobbyists being at a lesser intellectual level. Quite often they are better horsemen than the guys with the money at the elite level.

**The CHAIR** — That is fair comment. I just wonder sometimes if one of the characteristics of our industry is that we have more hobbyists, whether in some way we could not be encouraging hobbyists ahead of making a decision to buy this filly or send this broodmare to this stallion, whether in fact a better outcome would be a better credentialled stallion but it might mean they go partners with someone else in doing it. They end up with one potentially better-bred horse for either racing or selling than two mediocre-bred horses which will not sell well, they might race well or they might not, but it would just seem to me that it is an industry at that end where the passion overrules everything else. We have the passion but maybe we just need to temper it with advice.

**Dr ROE** — The attachment, definitely once you have a horse in work and you wake up every morning, feed it, pick up its poop, ride it, work it and you get attached to it, then that blinds your judgment on its ability. It definitely does and more so in hobbyists, they are probably less ruthless. How you educate them to ignore that emotional attachment would be very difficult. You can criticise someone's wife but you do not criticise their horse.

The CHAIR — All we could ever do is encourage people to seek some advice.

**Dr ROE** — Whether there is a role we, as educational institutions, could do by offering our breeding modules part-time for hobbyists is definitely something our management team always throws around. My argument always comes back to: we do what we have been doing for 25 years and we do it well with the current staff available; unless we find the funds somehow to employ someone else, then we will struggle. We are working flat out with the three staff we have at the moment, looking after the students to the best of our ability. There is definitely a demand out there, how great it is I am not sure, to deliver part-time education at a hobbyist level. Certainly we hire out our facilities more than anything for breeding nights put on by local vet practices and that kind of stuff, and they are definitely well attended — whether there is something there.

**The CHAIR** — Whether it is formal or informal, we need to be doing more to put out information and advice to people.

**Dr ROE** — The veterinary practices run them because it is a case of getting to know a client, it is a good client service, but there is no formal education process or requirements met by those short courses.

**The CHAIR** — I want to throw a curly one at you and if you feel you cannot offer an opinion this, fine, and apologies for asking you questions that are not strictly related to your work line at Marcus Oldham. We will be down there to see all that on Wednesday. Your being a horseman and vet, one of the things that interests me — and we learned this in Ireland, the race program and the breeding industry is much more integrated so they have more black type events; they actually discourage the under-performing horses. They organise the race program to feed into the breeding industry. In Victoria, traditionally, the lead race for breeders was the Victoria Derby, it would be the new emerging standing of the colt, it was always just a colt's race. We run it over 2500 metres which is for very young horses that just turned three years old and some of them are not even turned three years old. The AJC Derby runs four months later, the same distance or thereabouts. Is the Victoria Derby typically too long for horses at that age. The record seems to suggest it burns horses out, they do not seem to kick on as much as the AJC Derby winners. Do you have a view on that?

**Dr ROE** — It is a very uninformed view because as yet I have not trained a three-year-old to go over 2400 or 2500. I am dealing with second-hand horses. At this stage I have got two three-year-olds in the paddock, they have just turned three, one has just come into work as such, the other one still to my eye — and I have not been in racing stables very long — is not even ready to canter yet and it is a three-year-old. From my limited experience getting three-year-olds to go 2500 metres is a big ask. It does not mean it should not be run, though. Do not assume the trainers are cruel to their horses. If a trainer does not think it suits the horse, he will not run it. Therefore by having it there we might be actually encouraging our breeders to breed more precocious, tougher horses that can stand up to the work. That would be my way of looking at it. A lot of people seem to think that all trainers are cruel, tough and ruthless because they are in a numbers game and they have got a high turnover. I disagree with that. Trainers are in it because they love horses and they are not going to change that. Good trainers love horses and do the numbers game well. That is my opinion. I would not think of reducing the distance. When you compare it to European standards, we have a very poor record on breeding stayers. Maybe we need a couple

more events like that to encourage it a little more — bigger prize money. The Golden Slipper is the one we all aim for because it has the biggest carrot there.

**The CHAIR** — Do you have any thoughts on broodmare management? Many people have come to this inquiry and talked about the need for stallions and how you cannot get enough good stallions in Victoria, and the breeding industry revolves around them. We could have better stallions in Victoria if people chose to buy and locate them here, but in terms of what benefit that delivers, in large measure it is also a function of the quality of broodmares you are sending to them. Do you have a view as to whether there is enough emphasis placed on broodmare quality?

**Dr ROE** — By the good breeders there is; probably less by the hobbyist. The breeder of Zazzman, who ran third in the Cup a couple of years ago, she made a big switch probably seven or eight years ago and went out and bought three very good stakes performed broodmares, and they have produced much better quality horses. Money is the limiting factor, as always. Everyone knows what a good broodmare is worth, and the people who can afford them buy them; the others make do with what they have got.

**The CHAIR** — It was not until last Friday that I spoke informally to someone who emphasised to me the need to be very good at pasture management when raising horses, and she said this typically was not something that was widespread. She said without good pasture you are tying one hand behind your back and not getting the nutrition into young horses in particular. Do you have any views on this?

**Dr ROE** — We do teach a 28-hour pastures module as a part of horse property management. Pastures are vital. All my horses in work are on the grass the majority of time, and fertiliser and seed is your cheapest form of feed as far as being cost effective. At a hobby or small-scale level the majority of people do not realise that. Certainly on your big farms they all have very good feed and employ appropriate managers full time. But from a veterinary point of view and from my experience in struggling with cash over the years and trying to find the cheapest form of feed and most effective form, pastures is definitely important.

**The CHAIR** — And the absence of well-kept pasture or an absence of resowing and rundown pasture is what? Is it that horses do not grow as much as they should or is it bone density or other things as well?

**Dr ROE** — Growth. Horses are made to graze 80 per cent of the time. That is just evolution, the way their digestive tract is designed — little and often. When we start putting them on poor or no pasture at all and put them around a three-feeds-a-day place , or a two-feeds-a-day place if they are not so lucky, it is a totally different way of doing things. I am not a nutrition expert, Dr Peter Huntington is probably the man to talk to about that, but you get changes in blood glucose curves which causes an insulin response which definitely affects growth rates. Does that answer your question? It is an important process. As to why, I would say evolution produced them that way. If you want a more scientific explanation, Kentucky Equine Research, the company where Peter Huntington works, is the best place to talk to.

The CHAIR — The person on Friday also mentioned him.

**Dr ROE** — Yes. They are very much the leaders in the research side of nutrition.

The CHAIR — Where is he based?

**Dr ROE** — In Melbourne. He lectures at the college. They teach our nutrition lectures. One of our graduates — Megan Luckhurst — works for him. That is her maiden name; I can't remember her married name.

**The CHAIR** — I have one more question: one thing that intrigues me is the concentration of breeding investment in Victoria. We have a fair bit around Nagambie and Euroa, and another cluster in the northern suburbs of Melbourne out through to around Mount Macedon, and we have a little on the Peninsula. The Western District historically did have some — Chester Manifold and others — it is a very strong racing area and probably the strongest area of the state. But apart from two or three studs nowadays, the breeding side has really diminished. Is there a reason for that because historically that western soil was as good as any for raising horses, but we don't see that now.

**Dr ROE** — This is only my opinion, but I think horse people are very easily led rather than being logical about it. Certainly out in the Western District they grow enough good cattle out there and the country is very fertile.

If a good horse comes from one region they think it has something to do with the dirt rather than seeing that it could be a whole combination of genetics, dirt, upbringing, breeding, training, feeding, all those kinds of things. So I would say that that would be the reason, maybe — that no good horses came out of there for a while, so people started congregating around the stud farms that were producing good horses.

Mr JENKINS — I was going to say, 'What about Gippsland?'.

**The CHAIR** — Apart from your own 170 acres and Gippsland, where do you think is the best for breeding? Would your view be that with good management of horses, with good property management and good choices in breeding, you end up raising good horses, so there is no difference anywhere, really?

**Dr ROE** — Possibly one thing about the Western District if I were to breed out there — I would want very good shelter belts from the cold south-westerlies that come through for nine months of the year or four months, depending on the season or that particular year. That would be the only thing. The cold, wet weather knocks animals around if they do not have adequate protection. They use too much energy for keeping warm rather than growing bigger and stronger.

**The CHAIR** — Typically that means in Victoria, south of the Great Divide would be less favourably than north of the divide, as a rule?

Dr ROE — Yes.

**Mr PULLEN** — How does your course differ from the previous people from the Northern Metropolitan Institute of TAFE? And if I get the flick out of Parliament, am I too old to take a course on?

The CHAIR — You might be too heavy for the jockey side of things!

**Dr ROE** — No, certainly not. We have a few older ones every year. We have a 41-year old Korean steward doing it this year, a 40-year old boy from Singapore turf club who managed Dominos Pizzas for 10 years in Hong Kong, so no. And certainly 30 per cent of our students are over 25 years of age. We get a lot of punters who come in and want to learn more about the breeding side and start their own broodmare band or go into a training stable and that sort of thing. It is funny like that — there are certainly a lot of mid-life crisis people who come into the racing world. Maybe I am one of them!

The CHAIR — It is the sea change experience!

**Dr ROE** — I think it is. So there are plenty of mature age students.

Mr PULLEN — What about comparing to the Northern Metropolitan Institute of TAFE?

**Dr ROE** — To be honest, I do not know a lot about them. We tend to focus on what we do. I would love to pay someone to go and research the completion rates of these courses, the TAFE courses, all of them. We certainly have a very good completion rate because they have spent the money. I am not sure if they are all on-the-job training or full-time or part-time courses. We tend to boast about our networks and the success of our graduates. We have several Group 1 winning trainers come out of our place, people managing studs in the Hunter Valley and Victoria, head honchos of South Australian racing, all that sort of stuff, and those people remain loyal to the College and we use the networks very well. But I guess any education institution has its successes. We have two Olympians also. The difference is perhaps small class sizes. We get to know our students very well. The biggest difference would be they pay to come so they are fair dinkum about coming.

**Mr PULLEN** — And you said that would be from February through to December, basically five days a week other than the holiday period?

**Dr ROE** — They probably get about three weeks off in that time. That is how we fit a diploma into one year. We do not give them time off. Whether there are laws against that for students, I am not sure. But in the three weeks they do have off we encourage them to spend extra time in their practical placements. They are over in New Zealand; they leave on Saturday. After that they can do three weeks stud placement in New Zealand, then they have two weeks holiday. We encourage them to extend their stud placement to five weeks. We say it is short term; you do not need a holiday.

Mr JENKINS — Is there part sponsorship of the course?

**Dr ROE** — Some students, yes, and we get industry sponsorship from Collingrove Stud and Eliza Park through free service fees. We have someone employed chasing industry sponsorship. KER sponsors us through supply of computer programs and 8 hours of lecturing free, and then they deliver another 10 hours at a reduced rate.

Mr JENKINS — Employers are not as yet paying for somebody to do the whole course?

**Dr ROE** — Not Australian employers. I could see that as a big advance. If we could have organisations or private people who have someone who has worked for them for a year or two, who they think are head-honcho management material or someone who will stick with them, they could pay for their fees and then come back and work. Apollo Ng of Hong Kong sponsored a couple. One of them stayed in Australia and he could not make him go back. He works for Gai Waterhouse now, but it is hard to have a legally binding contract to enforce someone to work for you after you pay \$27 000 to educate them, but that is a definite possibility and it is a sensible way of doing it.

**The CHAIR** — Nick, you have given us a real taste of what we are going to see on Wednesday. I am looking forward to it. Thank you very much. Is there anything else you want to add to your contribution?

**Dr ROE** — As far as educating young people within the industry, there are three things: we need to have some sort of mentoring system for young people. Practical skills are very important and we now, because of automobiles and the lack of rural people not having basic horse handling skills, we have a lot of mature people coming in to learn about how to handle horses. You cannot teach that in 12 months. We need a mentoring system; teaching people basic horse handling takes time. These big operations that employ a lot of people do not have the time to spend to teach them good basics around horse handling. Another thing is keeping your good workers, and linked to that is that we need to have an award that is not based on age; it is based on experience and skill level rather than just being over the age of 23. There are plenty of 16 and 17-year-old kids who are more confident at handling horses than 25-year-olds.

Also there is maybe a need for a specific equine vet nurse qualification. On these studs if someone gives a needle to a horse and for whatever reason there is an adverse reaction, the person who gave that needle is not covered by insurance unless they are a veterinary surgeon. We need to have people out there. My colleagues will not like me saying it but we need people who are able to administer penicillin and be covered by insurance.

**The CHAIR** — I think the AWU in its submission talked about staff who are asked in the middle of the night to stitch up mares and all sorts of things without any formal training, and the same thing would apply there.

**Dr ROE** — Yes. I teach my guys how to inject but I also teach them that they are not covered by insurance, so they need to be aware of that.

**The CHAIR** — That says something about the industry though does it not? The breeding season requires interventions of all sorts, and they are in a position where most of the assistance rendered is by people who are not vets, so most of the interventions at that point will be by people who are not vets — and you still have this problem of very expensive thoroughbreds — and presumably this intervention, which is not done by a vet, is not insured, so they leave themselves wide open; but this has been going on forever.

**Mr JENKINS** — It is a closed shop with the vets, though.

Dr ROE — Yes.

**The CHAIR** — I understand that but you need to deal with it. That is a fair point; we will note that. Thank you very much. We will see you Wednesday, but sometime after that we will get that transcript to you and you are welcome to correct it and send it back to us. We will make sure you get a good mention in the report and lots of copies are sent down to you.

Dr ROE — Thanks, I appreciate it.

Witness withdrew.