EXTRACT FROM THE MINUTES OF PROCEEDINGS

Monday 10 August 2009

Chapter 12: Thriving Economy.

Motion: Subject to minor amendments that *Chapter 12: Thriving Economy* be agreed

to and the chapter adopted.

Moved: Robin Scott MP Seconded: Kim Wells MP

Resolved in the affirmative.

Monday 31 August 2009

Chapter 5: COAG Reform Agenda and Productivity in Victoria

Motion: That Chapter 5: COAG Reform Agenda and Productivity in Victoria be

agreed to and the chapter adopted.

Moved: Kim Wells MP Seconded: Jennifer Huppert MLC

Resolved in the affirmative.

Chapter 11: Analysis of the Government Response to Recommendations in the

Public Accounts and Estimates Committee Report on the 2008-09

Budget Estimates – Part Three

Motion: That Chapter 11: Analysis of the Government Response to

Recommendations in the Public Accounts and Estimates Committee Report on the 2008-09 Budget Estimates – Part Three be agreed to and the chapter

adopted.

Moved: Gordon Rich-Phillips MLC Seconded: Wade Noonan MP

Resolved in the affirmative.

Monday 14 September 2009

Chapter 2: Key Aspects of the 2009-10 Budget

Motion: Subject to minor amendments that *Chapter 2: Key Aspects of the 2009-10*

Budget be agreed to and the chapter adopted.

Moved: Wade Noonan MP Seconded: Richard Dalla-Riva MLC

Resolved in the affirmative.

Chapter 6: General Government Revenue / Revenue Initiatives

Motion: Subject to minor amendments that *Chapter 6: General Government*

Revenue / Revenue Initiatives be agreed to and the chapter adopted.

Moved: Richard Dalla-Riva MLC Seconded: Jennifer Huppert MLC

Resolved in the affirmative.

Chapter 11: Analysis of the Government Response to Recommendations in the

Public Accounts and Estimates Committee Report on the 2008-09

Budget Estimates – Part Three

Motion: That the amendment to Chapter 11: Analysis of the Government Response

to Recommendations in the Public Accounts and Estimates Committee Report on the 2008-09 Budget Estimates – Part Three (a chapter previously agreed to and adopted on 31 August 2009 by the Committee) be agreed to

and re-adopted.

Moved: Bill Sykes MP Seconded: Robin Scott MP

Resolved in the affirmative.

Monday 12 October 2009

Chapter 1: Introduction

Motion: That *Chapter 1: Introduction* be agreed to and the chapter adopted.

Moved: Wade Noonan MP Seconded: Sue Pennicuik MLC

Resolved in the affirmative.

Chapter 3: Management and Accountability for Commonwealth Grants and Funds

Motion: That Chapter 3: Management and Accountability for Commonwealth Grants

and Funds be agreed to and the chapter adopted.

Moved: Robin Scott MP Seconded: Bill Sykes MP

Resolved in the affirmative.

Chapter 4: Departmental Asset Investment

The Committee agreed to a change in the title of the chapter to *General Government Sector Asset Investment*.

Motion: Subject to minor amendments that Chapter 4: General Government Sector

Asset Investment be agreed to and the chapter adopted.

Moved: Janice Munt MP Seconded: Sue Pennicuik MLC

Resolved in the affirmative.

Chapter 7: Revenue Foregone/Tax Expenditures, Concessions and Subsidies

Motion: Subject to minor amendments that *Chapter 7: Revenue Foregone/Tax*

Expenditures, Concessions and Subsidies be agreed to and the chapter

adopted.

Moved: Bill Sykes MP Seconded: Wade Noonan MP

Resolved in the affirmative.

Chapter 8: Regional Victoria Initiatives and Related Issues

Motion: That Chapter 8: Regional Victoria Initiatives and Related Issues be agreed

to and the chapter adopted.

Moved: Jennifer Huppert MLC Seconded: Richard Dalla-Riva MLC

Resolved in the affirmative.

Chapter 9: Departmental Output Structures and Performance Measures

Motion: That Chapter 9: Departmental Output Structures and Performance

Measures be agreed to and the chapter adopted.

Moved: Sue Pennicuik MLC Seconded: Robin Scott MP

Resolved in the affirmative.

Chapter 10: Departmental Workforce – Comparative Analysis

Motion: Subject to minor amendments that Chapter 10: Departmental Workforce –

Comparative Analysis be agreed to and the chapter adopted.

Moved: Robin Scott MP Seconded: Wade Noonan MP

Resolved in the affirmative.

Chapter 12: Thriving Economy

Motion: That the amendments to *Chapter 12: Thriving Economy* (a chapter

previously agreed to and adopted on 10 August 2009 by the Committee) be

agreed to and the chapter re-adopted.

Moved: Bill Sykes MP Seconded: Robin Scott MP

Resolved in the affirmative.

Chapter 13: Quality Health and Education

Motion: Subject to minor amendments that Chapter 13: Quality Health and

Education be agreed to and the chapter adopted.

Moved: Robin Scott MP Seconded: Gordon Rich-Phillips MLC

Resolved in the affirmative.

Chapter 14: Healthy Environment

Motion: That the 14th paragraph under 14.2.5 Irrigation which currently reads:

'Several members of the Committee believed that the Government should

provide further details of estimates for water savings (including

assumptions used, volumetric targets, construction and operating costs) for

significant projects including the NVIRP',

should stay as part of the report but be amended with the deletion of the words 'Several members of' so that the paragraph reads as follows:

'The Committee believed that the Government should provide further details of estimates for water savings (including assumptions used, volumetric targets, construction and operating costs) for significant projects including the NVIRP.'

Moved: Gordon Rich-Phillips MLC Seconded: Kim Wells MP

The Committee was divided on the motion:

Ayes
Kim Wells MP
Bob Stensholt MP
Gordon Rich-Phillips MLC
Bill Sykes MP
Jennifer Huppert MLC
Sue Pennicuik MLC
Wade Noonan MP
Richard Dalla-Riva MLC
Robin Scott MP

Under Section 24 of the *Parliamentary Committees Act 2003*, the Chair used his casting vote.

Motion negatived.

Motion: That the following additional key finding under paragraph 14.3 be included:

14.3 a The Committee notes the substantial public concern regarding the basis for claimed savings for the Food Bowl Modernisation Project and that as at the time of printing this report, the Government has not made public the business case for the project in spite of a recommendation by the Auditor-General (in April 2008) to publish the detailed analysis underpinning the estimates of water savings and costs for the Food Bowl Modernisation Project.

The Committee recommends that the Auditor-General's recommendations be actioned immediately.

Moved: Bill Sykes MP Seconded: Kim Wells MP

The Committee was divided on the motion:

Aves Navs

Kim Wells MP
Gordon Rich-Phillips MLC
Bill Sykes MP
Sue Pennicuik MLC
Richard Dalla-Riva MLC
Bob Stensholt MP
Janice Munt MP
Jennifer Huppert MLC
Wade Noonan MP
Robin Scott MP

Under Section 24 of the *Parliamentary Committees Act 2003*, the Chair used his casting vote.

Motion negatived.

Motion: That the following additional key finding under paragraph 14.3 be included:

14.3 b The Committee is concerned about the inconsistency being applied by the Government which uses historical long term water inflows in the Murray Darling Basis to demonstrate availability of savings and uses short term, below average inflows in Melbourne's catchments to demonstrate Melbourne's need for water.

Moved: Bill Sykes MP Seconded: Kim Wells MP

The Committee was divided on the motion:

Ayes Nays

Kim Wells MP
Gordon Rich-Phillips MLC
Bill Sykes MP
Sue Pennicuik MLC
Richard Dalla-Riva MLC

Bob Stensholt MP
Janice Munt MP
Jennifer Huppert MLC
Wade Noonan MP
Robin Scott MP

Under Section 24 of the *Parliamentary Committees Act 2003*, the Chair used his casting vote.

Motion negatived.

Motion: That the word 'claimed' be added to key finding 14.4 to read as follows:

'One of the claimed benefits of irrigation improvements is that additional environmental flows can be provided for natural waterways. The Committee has recommended that the Government consider volumetric targets and reporting for environmental flows.'

Moved: Sue Pennicuik MLC Seconded: Bill Sykes MP

The Committee was divided on the motion:

Ayes Nays

Kim Wells MP
Gordon Rich-Phillips MLC
Bill Sykes MP
Sue Pennicuik MLC
Richard Dalla-Riva MLC
Bob Stensholt MP
Janice Munt MP
Jennifer Huppert MLC
Wade Noonan MP
Robin Scott MP

Under Section 24 of the *Parliamentary Committees Act 2003*, the Chair used his casting vote.

Motion negatived.

Motion: Subject to agreed amendments that *Chapter 14: Healthy Environment* be

agreed to and the chapter adopted.

Moved: Jennifer Huppert MLC Seconded: Robin Scott MP

The Committee was divided on the motion:

Ayes Nays

Bob Stensholt MP Kim Wells MP

Janice Munt MP Gordon Rich-Phillips MLC

Jennifer Huppert MLC Bill Sykes MP

Wade Noonan MP Richard Dalla-Riva MLC Robin Scott MP Sue Pennicuik MLC

Under Section 24 of the Parliamentary Committees Act 2003, the Chair used his casting vote.

Resolved in the affirmative.

Chapter 15: Caring Communities

Motion: That *Chapter 15: Caring Communities* be agreed to and the chapter

adopted.

Moved: Robin Scott MP Seconded: Bill Sykes MP

Resolved in the affirmative.

Chapter 16: Vibrant Democracy

Motion: That *Chapter 16: Vibrant Democracy* be agreed to and the chapter adopted.

Moved: Robin Scott MP Seconded: Bill Sykes MP

Resolved in the affirmative.

Appendix 1 & Appendix 2:

Motion: That Appendix 1: Acronyms and Abbreviations and Appendix 2: List of

Persons and Departments Providing Evidence and Responses to the Estimates Questionnaire be agreed to and the chapters adopted.

Moved: Kim Wells MP Seconded: Wade Noonan MP

Resolved in the affirmative.

Appendix 3 & Appendix 4:

Motion: That Appendix 3: Responses to Requests for Clarification on Specific Issues

and Appendix 4: Responses to Further Information to be provided and Questions on Notice relating to the 2009-10 Budget Estimates be agreed to

and the chapters adopted.

Moved: Wade Noonan MP Seconded: Richard Dalla-Riva MLC

Resolved in the affirmative.

Appendix 5: Timeliness and Quality of Responses from Departments and Ministers

Motion: That a list of all Ministers be published with the date they attended public

hearings, the numbers of Questions on Notice, the date of responses to Questions on Notice and the number of days late for a period in excess of

30 days.

Moved: Kim Wells MP Seconded: Bill Sykes MP

The Committee was divided on the motion:

Ayes Nays

Kim Wells MP
Gordon Rich-Phillips MLC
Bill Sykes MP
Sue Pennicuik MLC
Richard Dalla-Riva MLC
Bob Stensholt MP
Janice Munt MP
Jennifer Huppert MLC
Wade Noonan MP
Robin Scott MP

Under Section 24 of the *Parliamentary Committees Act 2003*, the Chair used his casting vote.

Motion negatived.

Motion: That a list of Ministers and the Departments which they are attached to,

along with the dates they attended the public hearings and the dates the Questionnaire responses were received by the Committee, be recorded.

The Committee was divided on the motion:

Ayes Nays

Kim Wells MP
Gordon Rich-Phillips MLC
Bill Sykes MP
Sue Pennicuik MLC
Richard Dalla-Riva MLC
Bob Stensholt MP
Janice Munt MP
Jennifer Huppert MLC
Wade Noonan MP
Robin Scott MP

Under Section 24 of the Parliamentary Committees Act 2003, the Chair used his casting vote.

Motion negatived.

Motion: Subject to amendments and as revised, that *Appendix 5: Timeliness and*

Quality of Responses from Departments and Ministers be agreed to and

adopted.

Moved: Robin Scott MP Seconded: Wade Noonan MP

The Committee was divided on the motion:

Ayes Nays

Janice Munt MP Kim Wells MP

Jennifer Huppert MLC Gordon Rich-Phillips MLC

Wade Noonan MP Bill Sykes MP

Robin Scott MP Richard Dalla-Riva MLC

Sue Pennicuik MLC

Resolved in the affirmative.

Report Adoption

Motion: That the whole of the Report on the 2009 10 Budget Estimates Part Two

including all Appendices be adopted and tabled.

Moved: Jennifer Huppert MLC Seconded: Robin Scott MP

The Committee was divided on the motion:

Ayes
Janice Munt MP
Jennifer Huppert MLC
Wade Noonan MP
Robin Scott MP
Sue Pennicuik MLC

Nays Kim Wells MP Gordon Rich-Phillips MLC Bill Sykes MP Richard Dalla-Riva MLC

Resolved in the affirmative.