

## **EXTRACT FROM THE MINUTES OF PROCEEDINGS**



## Monday 10 August 2009

### **Chapter 12: Thriving Economy.**

Motion: Subject to minor amendments that *Chapter 12: Thriving Economy* be agreed to and the chapter adopted.

Moved: Robin Scott MP                      Seconded: Kim Wells MP

Resolved in the affirmative.

## Monday 31 August 2009

### **Chapter 5: COAG Reform Agenda and Productivity in Victoria**

Motion: That *Chapter 5: COAG Reform Agenda and Productivity in Victoria* be agreed to and the chapter adopted.

Moved: Kim Wells MP                      Seconded: Jennifer Huppert MLC

Resolved in the affirmative.

### **Chapter 11: Analysis of the Government Response to Recommendations in the Public Accounts and Estimates Committee Report on the 2008-09 Budget Estimates – Part Three**

Motion: That *Chapter 11: Analysis of the Government Response to Recommendations in the Public Accounts and Estimates Committee Report on the 2008-09 Budget Estimates – Part Three* be agreed to and the chapter adopted.

Moved: Gordon Rich-Phillips MLC      Seconded: Wade Noonan MP

Resolved in the affirmative.

## Monday 14 September 2009

### **Chapter 2: Key Aspects of the 2009-10 Budget**

Motion: Subject to minor amendments that *Chapter 2: Key Aspects of the 2009-10 Budget* be agreed to and the chapter adopted.

Moved: Wade Noonan MP                      Seconded: Richard Dalla-Riva MLC

Resolved in the affirmative.

### **Chapter 6: General Government Revenue / Revenue Initiatives**

Motion: Subject to minor amendments that *Chapter 6: General Government Revenue / Revenue Initiatives* be agreed to and the chapter adopted.

Moved: Richard Dalla-Riva MLC                      Seconded: Jennifer Huppert MLC

Resolved in the affirmative.



**Chapter 8: Regional Victoria Initiatives and Related Issues**

Motion: That *Chapter 8: Regional Victoria Initiatives and Related Issues* be agreed to and the chapter adopted.

Moved: Jennifer Huppert MLC                      Seconded: Richard Dalla-Riva MLC

Resolved in the affirmative.

**Chapter 9: Departmental Output Structures and Performance Measures**

Motion: That *Chapter 9: Departmental Output Structures and Performance Measures* be agreed to and the chapter adopted.

Moved: Sue Pennicuik MLC                      Seconded: Robin Scott MP

Resolved in the affirmative.

**Chapter 10: Departmental Workforce – Comparative Analysis**

Motion: Subject to minor amendments that *Chapter 10: Departmental Workforce – Comparative Analysis* be agreed to and the chapter adopted.

Moved: Robin Scott MP                      Seconded: Wade Noonan MP

Resolved in the affirmative.

**Chapter 12: Thriving Economy**

Motion: That the amendments to *Chapter 12: Thriving Economy* (a chapter previously agreed to and adopted on 10 August 2009 by the Committee) be agreed to and the chapter re-adopted.

Moved: Bill Sykes MP                      Seconded: Robin Scott MP

Resolved in the affirmative.

**Chapter 13: Quality Health and Education**

Motion: Subject to minor amendments that *Chapter 13: Quality Health and Education* be agreed to and the chapter adopted.

Moved: Robin Scott MP                      Seconded: Gordon Rich-Phillips MLC

Resolved in the affirmative.

**Chapter 14: Healthy Environment**

Motion: That the 14th paragraph under 14.2.5 Irrigation which currently reads:

*‘Several members of the Committee believed that the Government should provide further details of estimates for water savings (including assumptions used, volumetric targets, construction and operating costs) for significant projects including the NVIRP’,*

should stay as part of the report but be amended with the deletion of the words ‘Several members of’ so that the paragraph reads as follows:

*‘The Committee believed that the Government should provide further details of estimates for water savings (including assumptions used, volumetric targets, construction and operating costs) for significant projects including the NVIRP.’*

Moved: Gordon Rich-Phillips MLC      Seconded: Kim Wells MP

The Committee was divided on the motion:

<b>Ayes</b>	<b>Nays</b>
Kim Wells MP	Bob Stensholt MP
Gordon Rich-Phillips MLC	Janice Munt MP
Bill Sykes MP	Jennifer Huppert MLC
Sue Pennicuik MLC	Wade Noonan MP
Richard Dalla-Riva MLC	Robin Scott MP

Under Section 24 of the *Parliamentary Committees Act 2003*, the Chair used his casting vote.

Motion negated.

Motion: That the following additional key finding under paragraph 14.3 be included:

*14.3 a The Committee notes the substantial public concern regarding the basis for claimed savings for the Food Bowl Modernisation Project and that as at the time of printing this report, the Government has not made public the business case for the project in spite of a recommendation by the Auditor-General (in April 2008) to publish the detailed analysis underpinning the estimates of water savings and costs for the Food Bowl Modernisation Project.*

*The Committee recommends that the Auditor-General’s recommendations be actioned immediately.*

Moved: Bill Sykes MP      Seconded: Kim Wells MP

The Committee was divided on the motion:

<b>Ayes</b>	<b>Nays</b>
Kim Wells MP	Bob Stensholt MP
Gordon Rich-Phillips MLC	Janice Munt MP
Bill Sykes MP	Jennifer Huppert MLC
Sue Pennicuik MLC	Wade Noonan MP
Richard Dalla-Riva MLC	Robin Scott MP

Under Section 24 of the *Parliamentary Committees Act 2003*, the Chair used his casting vote.

Motion negated.

Motion: That the following additional key finding under paragraph 14.3 be included:



Janice Munt MP  
Jennifer Huppert MLC  
Wade Noonan MP  
Robin Scott MP

Gordon Rich-Phillips MLC  
Bill Sykes MP  
Richard Dalla-Riva MLC  
Sue Pennicuik MLC

Under Section 24 of the *Parliamentary Committees Act 2003*, the Chair used his casting vote.

Resolved in the affirmative.

**Chapter 15: Caring Communities**

Motion: That *Chapter 15: Caring Communities* be agreed to and the chapter adopted.

Moved: Robin Scott MP                      Seconded: Bill Sykes MP

Resolved in the affirmative.

**Chapter 16: Vibrant Democracy**

Motion: That *Chapter 16: Vibrant Democracy* be agreed to and the chapter adopted.

Moved: Robin Scott MP                      Seconded: Bill Sykes MP

Resolved in the affirmative.

**Appendix 1 & Appendix 2:**

Motion: That *Appendix 1: Acronyms and Abbreviations* and *Appendix 2: List of Persons and Departments Providing Evidence and Responses to the Estimates Questionnaire* be agreed to and the chapters adopted.

Moved: Kim Wells MP                      Seconded: Wade Noonan MP

Resolved in the affirmative.

**Appendix 3 & Appendix 4:**

Motion: That *Appendix 3: Responses to Requests for Clarification on Specific Issues* and *Appendix 4: Responses to Further Information to be provided and Questions on Notice relating to the 2009-10 Budget Estimates* be agreed to and the chapters adopted.

Moved: Wade Noonan MP                      Seconded: Richard Dalla-Riva MLC

Resolved in the affirmative.

**Appendix 5: Timeliness and Quality of Responses from Departments and Ministers**

Motion: That a list of all Ministers be published with the date they attended public hearings, the numbers of Questions on Notice, the date of responses to Questions on Notice and the number of days late for a period in excess of 30 days.





Moved: Jennifer Huppert MLC

Seconded: Robin Scott MP

The Committee was divided on the motion:

**Ayes**

Janice Munt MP  
Jennifer Huppert MLC  
Wade Noonan MP  
Robin Scott MP  
Sue Pennicuik MLC

**Nays**

Kim Wells MP  
Gordon Rich-Phillips MLC  
Bill Sykes MP  
Richard Dalla-Riva MLC

Resolved in the affirmative.