



# **PUBLIC ACCOUNTS AND ESTIMATES COMMITTEE**

**88<sup>th</sup> REPORT TO THE PARLIAMENT**

## **Report on the 2009–10 Budget Estimates – Part Two**

---

**October 2009**

---

Ordered to be  
printed

---

By Authority  
Government Printer for the State of Victoria

No. 233

Session 2006-09



# **PUBLIC ACCOUNTS AND ESTIMATES COMMITTEE**

Address: Parliament of Victoria  
Spring Street  
East Melbourne Victoria 3002

Telephone: (03) 8682 2867

Facsimile: (03) 8682 2898

Email: *paec@parliament.vic.gov.au*

Internet: *www.parliament.vic.gov.au/paec*

**Parliament of Victoria**  
**Public Accounts and Estimates Committee**

*Report on the 2009–10  
Budget Estimates – Part Two*

*ISBN 978 0 9806614 3 9*



The reports on the 2009-10 Budget Estimates produced by the Committee consists of two parts and includes:

**Part One – Volume One**

- an index of key matters raised at the Budget Estimates hearings;
- departmental information;
- questions on notice; and
- the Government's response to the *2008-09 Budget Estimates Report*.

**Part One – Volume Two**

- transcripts of evidence of the Budget Estimates hearings.

**Part Two**

- information relating to responses to questions taken on notice and further information provided by the Presiding Officers, Premier, Treasurer and ministers. Additional information sought in relation to the responses received to the Committee's Budget Estimates questionnaire; and
- analysis, key findings and recommendations relating to the Budget Estimates for 2009-10.



	3.4.1 Management and accountability implications to Victoria.....	48
<b>CHAPTER 4:</b>	<b>GENERAL GOVERNMENT SECTOR ASSET INVESTMENT.....</b>	<b>51</b>
4.1	Introduction .....	52
4.2	Trend analysis of net investment in fixed assets as a percentage of Gross State Product .....	52
4.3	Asset investment provisions within the 2009-10 Budget Estimates .....	54
	4.3.1 Operating surplus .....	55
	4.3.2 Commonwealth Government funding.....	55
	4.3.3 General government sector borrowing.....	55
4.4	Asset funding by department during 2009-10 .....	56
4.5	Asset investment observations .....	58
	4.5.1 The Department of Education and Early Childhood Development.....	59
	4.5.2 The Department of Human Services .....	62
	4.5.3 The Department of Justice .....	63
	4.5.4 The Department of Primary Industries .....	65
	4.5.5 The Department of Sustainability and Environment.....	66
	4.5.6 The Department of Transport .....	67
4.6	Reporting by departments on net benefits derived from asset investments .....	68
<b>CHAPTER 5:</b>	<b>COAG REFORM AGENDA AND PRODUCTIVITY IN VICTORIA.....</b>	<b>71</b>
5.1	Introduction .....	73
5.2	Past coverage by the Committee.....	74
5.3	COAG deliberations prior to the handing down of the Victorian 2009-10 Budget on 5 May 2009 .....	77
5.4	COAG recent deliberations subsequent to the handing down of the 2009-10 Budget .....	79
5.5	National Agreements/SPP and National Partnerships - accountability measures .....	81
5.6	COAG Reform Council.....	83
5.7	How is economic reform and productivity addressed in Victoria’s May 2009 Budget Papers?.....	85
5.8	Areas earmarked for productivity improvement in 2009-10 by departments.....	86
5.9	Productivity Commission’s review of business regulation .....	89
<b>CHAPTER 6:</b>	<b>GENERAL GOVERNMENT REVENUE / REVENUE INITIATIVES .....</b>	<b>91</b>
6.1	Introduction .....	92
6.2	Competitiveness of Victoria’s taxation system.....	93
6.3	Composition of Victoria’s General Government Sector’s revenue estimates.....	94
6.4	Major variations in revenue items .....	97
	6.4.1 2009-10 Budget compared to 2008-09 Revised Estimates.....	97
	6.4.2 2009-10 Budget compared to the Forward Estimates to 2012-13 .....	99

# CONTENTS

---

<b>PUBLIC ACCOUNTS AND ESTIMATES COMMITTEE MEMBERSHIP – 56<sup>TH</sup> PARLIAMENT .....</b>	<b>1</b>
<b>DUTIES OF THE COMMITTEE .....</b>	<b>3</b>
<b>CHAIR’S FOREWORD .....</b>	<b>5</b>
<b>RECOMMENDATIONS .....</b>	<b>7</b>
<b>CHAPTER 1: INTRODUCTION .....</b>	<b>15</b>
<b>1.1 Background.....</b>	<b>15</b>
<b>1.2 Process followed by the Public Accounts and Estimates     Committee for its review of the 2009-10 Budget Estimates .....</b>	<b>15</b>
1.2.1 Analysis, key findings and recommendations .....	16
1.2.2 Recent machinery of government changes.....	17
<b>1.3 Acknowledgment .....</b>	<b>17</b>
<b>CHAPTER 2: KEY ASPECTS OF THE 2009-10 BUDGET .....</b>	<b>19</b>
<b>2.1 Introduction .....</b>	<b>20</b>
<b>2.2 Key Budget themes .....</b>	<b>21</b>
<b>2.3 Fiscal target for operating surplus.....</b>	<b>22</b>
2.3.1 Revenue and expense projections for 2009-10 .....	24
<b>2.4 Bushfire recovery .....</b>	<b>26</b>
<b>2.5 Funding for infrastructure investments.....</b>	<b>27</b>
2.5.1 Level of net estimated infrastructure investment .....	27
2.5.2 Net debt projections .....	28
<b>2.6 Maintenance of triple-A credit rating .....</b>	<b>29</b>
<b>2.7 New funding initiatives for 2009-10.....</b>	<b>30</b>
<b>2.8 Contingency provisions .....</b>	<b>33</b>
<b>2.9 Efficiency targets assigned to departments in 2009-10.....</b>	<b>35</b>
<b>2.10 Revenue foregone measures.....</b>	<b>37</b>
2.10.1 Tax relief decisions.....	37
2.10.2 Tax expenditures and concessions.....	37
<b>CHAPTER 3: MANAGEMENT AND ACCOUNTABILITY FOR COMMONWEALTH GRANTS AND FUNDS.....</b>	<b>41</b>
<b>3.1 Introduction .....</b>	<b>41</b>
<b>3.2 Goods and Services Taxation (GST) grants.....</b>	<b>43</b>
<b>3.3 Analysis of estimates of Commonwealth funding (other than     GST grants) to Victoria announced in the 2009-10 Budget .....</b>	<b>43</b>
3.3.1 Funding to Victoria under Nation Building – Economic Stimulus Plan.....	44
3.3.2 Funding to Victoria under National Agreements and National Partnerships .....	46
<b>3.4 Accountability regime within new federal financial relations     framework.....</b>	<b>47</b>



6.5	Sales of goods and services – provision of services.....	102
6.6	Revenue initiatives contained in the 2009-10 Budget .....	103
<b>CHAPTER 7:</b>	<b>REVENUE FOREGONE / TAX EXPENDITURES, CONCESSIONS AND SUBSIDIES.....</b>	<b>105</b>
7.1	Introduction .....	106
7.2	Past coverage by the Committee .....	108
7.3	Tax expenditures .....	109
7.4	Concessions including subsidies contained in the budget .....	111
7.5	First home buyer initiatives .....	114
<b>CHAPTER 8:</b>	<b>REGIONAL AND RURAL VICTORIA .....</b>	<b>119</b>
8.1	Introduction .....	119
8.2	Follow-up of last year’s matters .....	124
8.3	Regional funding initiatives in the 2009-10 Budget.....	126
	8.3.1 Social impact of the drought.....	128
<b>CHAPTER 9:</b>	<b>DEPARTMENTAL OUTPUT STRUCTURES AND PERFORMANCE MEASURES .....</b>	<b>131</b>
9.1	Introduction .....	132
9.2	Development of output performance measures .....	133
9.3	Performance measures in the 2009-10 Budget.....	133
9.4	The role of sustainability measures in the performance measurement of the government departments.....	136
9.5	Net impact of 2009-10 Budget new output initiatives.....	137
<b>CHAPTER 10:</b>	<b>DEPARTMENTAL WORKFORCE – COMPARATIVE ANALYSIS .....</b>	<b>139</b>
10.1	Introduction .....	139
10.2	Changes in staff numbers in government departments .....	140
10.3	Staff numbers in major government sector departments and agencies.....	144
<b>CHAPTER 11:</b>	<b>ANALYSIS OF THE GOVERNMENT RESPONSE TO RECOMMENDATIONS IN THE PUBLIC ACCOUNTS AND ESTIMATES COMMITTEE REPORT ON THE 2008-09 BUDGET ESTIMATES – PART THREE .....</b>	<b>147</b>
11.1	Background.....	147
11.2	Government response to recommendations .....	148
	11.2.1 Accepted recommendations.....	150
	11.2.2 Recommendations ‘Under Review’ .....	154
	11.2.3 Recommendations that were rejected.....	154
<b>CHAPTER 12:</b>	<b>THRIVING ECONOMY .....</b>	<b>159</b>
12.1	Introduction to the Committee’s examination of Budget-related issues relevant to the Government’s Growing Victoria Together initiative .....	161

<b>12.2</b>	<b>Economic parameters.....</b>	<b>165</b>
	12.2.1 Contextual background.....	165
	12.2.2 Victorian economic projections contained in the Victorian 2009-10 Budget .....	165
	12.2.3 Economic parameters contained in the 2009-10 Commonwealth Budget .....	166
	12.2.4 Analysis of economic forecasts .....	167
	12.2.5 Impact of economic parameters on the Budget.....	169
	12.2.6 Key risks .....	169
	12.2.7 Impact of variations to forecasts on the Budget .....	171
	12.2.8 Economic forecasts subsequent to the handing down of the 2009-10 Victorian budget.....	172
<b>12.3</b>	<b>Job Creation .....</b>	<b>172</b>
	12.3.1 February 2009 Annual Statement of Government Intentions.....	172
	12.3.2 Budget direction.....	173
	12.3.3 Target setting.....	175
	12.3.4 Uptake of apprentices and trainees.....	176
	12.3.5 Jobs created as a result of major water projects.....	177
	12.3.6 Job losses in the manufacturing sector .....	178
<b>12.4</b>	<b>Victoria’s Transport Plan.....</b>	<b>178</b>
	12.4.1 February 2009 Statement of Government Intentions .....	178
	12.4.2 Select Committee on Train Services .....	179
	12.4.3 Victorian Auditor-General’s Annual Plan 2009-10.....	179
	12.4.4 Budget direction.....	180
	12.4.5 New X’tropolis Trains.....	182
	12.4.6 South Morang Rail Extension .....	182
	12.4.7 Sunbury rail line electrification.....	184
	12.4.8 New stations in growth areas .....	184
	12.4.9 Improving train operations – rail service efficiencies.....	185
	12.4.10 Better Roads – Regional Victoria Development .....	185
	12.4.11 Nation Building Program.....	185
	12.4.12 Peninsula Link .....	185
	12.4.13 Separating road and rail lines.....	186
<b>CHAPTER 13:</b>	<b>QUALITY HEALTH AND EDUCATION.....</b>	<b>187</b>
<b>13.1</b>	<b>Introduction .....</b>	<b>187</b>
<b>13.2</b>	<b>Literacy and Numeracy in schools.....</b>	<b>188</b>
	13.2.1 National Assessment Program – Literacy and Numeracy (NAPLAN).....	188
	13.2.2 Results of 2008 NAPLAN testing.....	189
	13.2.3 Results of NAPLAN testing for Indigenous students.....	189
	13.2.4 Government response to Committee recommendations related to the performance of Indigenous students .....	193
	13.2.5 Measuring performance of literacy and numeracy outcomes .....	193
<b>13.3</b>	<b>Mental health portfolio.....</b>	<b>195</b>
	13.3.1 Victorian Mental Health Reform Strategy .....	195
	13.3.2 Crisis Assessment and Treatment (CAT) service and 24 hour mental health triage service .....	197
<b>13.4</b>	<b>Ultranet.....</b>	<b>198</b>
	13.4.1 Ultranet Coaches.....	200

<b>CHAPTER 14:</b>	<b>HEALTHY ENVIRONMENT .....</b>	<b>203</b>
<b>14.1</b>	<b>Introduction .....</b>	<b>204</b>
	14.1.1 Challenges .....	204
<b>14.2</b>	<b>Water management.....</b>	<b>204</b>
	14.2.1 Water saving .....	205
	14.2.2 Assistance to business and industry to save water .....	205
	14.2.3 Water saving education programs .....	206
	14.2.4 Water saving rebates .....	207
	14.2.5 Irrigation.....	208
	14.2.6 Water recovery .....	210
	14.2.7 Treated wastewater.....	211
	14.2.8 Stormwater harvesting .....	211
	14.2.9 Water recycling.....	212
	14.2.10 Conclusion .....	212
<b>14.3</b>	<b>Sustainable energy .....</b>	<b>213</b>
	14.3.1 Renewable energy investment.....	213
	14.3.2 Renewable energy targets .....	215
	14.3.3 Non-renewable energy options .....	215
	14.3.4 Sustainable energy use.....	216
	14.3.5 Sustainable energy use in government.....	218
	14.3.6 Conclusion.....	218
<b>14.4</b>	<b>Climate change initiatives and programs for the agricultural sector .....</b>	<b>219</b>
	14.4.1 Challenges facing the agricultural sector .....	219
	14.4.2 Climate change action areas.....	220
	14.4.3 Conclusion.....	221
<b>14.5</b>	<b>Funding for the development and establishment of parks in Victoria.....</b>	<b>222</b>
	14.5.1 Development of parks .....	222
	14.5.2 River Red Gums.....	223
<b>CHAPTER 15:</b>	<b>CARING COMMUNITIES .....</b>	<b>227</b>
<b>15.1</b>	<b>Introduction .....</b>	<b>228</b>
<b>15.2</b>	<b>Child Protection and Family Services.....</b>	<b>229</b>
	15.2.1 Introduction.....	229
	15.2.2 DHS Child Protection staffing and workload .....	231
	15.2.3 Out-of-home care services .....	234
	15.2.4 Measuring quality outcomes for children and young people in out of home care .....	236
<b>15.3</b>	<b>Emergency management and disaster relief.....</b>	<b>238</b>
	15.3.1 Black Saturday Bushfires .....	238
	15.3.2 Emergency Services Communications .....	245
<b>15.4</b>	<b>Road Safety .....</b>	<b>246</b>
	15.4.1 Introduction.....	246
	15.4.2 Government's road safety strategy - Arrive Alive 2.....	248
	15.4.3 Road safety performance measurement.....	250
<b>CHAPTER 16:</b>	<b>VIBRANT DEMOCRACY .....</b>	<b>253</b>

<b>16.1</b>	<b>Introduction .....</b>	<b>254</b>
<b>16.2</b>	<b>Analysis of Surpluses and Deficits .....</b>	<b>255</b>
	16.2.1 Background.....	255
	16.2.2 2009-10 Budget results for Victoria compared to other jurisdictions .....	256
<b>16.3</b>	<b>Efficiencies .....</b>	<b>261</b>
	16.3.1 Background.....	261
	16.3.2 Breakdown of efficiencies to be achieved in 2009-10 by departments .....	265
	16.3.3 Ratio of estimated efficiencies for 2009-10 to the total output cost for each department.....	270
	16.3.4 Scope for improved presentation of planned efficiency savings in the Budget Papers .....	270
<b>APPENDICES</b>	<b>.....</b>	<b>273</b>
<b>APPENDIX 1:</b>	<b>ACRONYMS AND ABBREVIATIONS.....</b>	<b>275</b>
<b>APPENDIX 2:</b>	<b>LIST OF PERSONS AND DEPARTMENTS PROVIDING EVIDENCE AND RESPONSES TO THE ESTIMATES QUESTIONNAIRE .....</b>	<b>277</b>
<b>APPENDIX 3:</b>	<b>RESPONSES TO REQUESTS FOR CLARIFICATION ON SPECIFIC ISSUES .....</b>	<b>293</b>
<b>APPENDIX 4:</b>	<b>RESPONSES TO FURTHER INFORMATION TO BE PROVIDED AND QUESTIONS ON NOTICE RELATING TO THE 2009-10 BUDGET ESTIMATES .....</b>	<b>315</b>
<b>APPENDIX 5:</b>	<b>TIMELINESS AND QUALITY OF RESPONSES FROM DEPARTMENTS AND MINISTERS .....</b>	<b>405</b>
<b>MINORITY REPORTS</b>	<b>.....</b>	<b>409</b>
<b>EXTRACT FROM THE MINUTES OF PROCEEDINGS .....</b>		<b>417</b>