



# **PUBLIC ACCOUNTS AND ESTIMATES COMMITTEE**

**94<sup>th</sup> REPORT TO THE PARLIAMENT**

---

## **Report on the 2008-09 Financial and Performance Outcomes**

---

**May 2010**

---

Ordered to be  
printed

---

By Authority  
Government Printer for the State of Victoria

No. 286  
Session 2006–10

# **PUBLIC ACCOUNTS AND ESTIMATES COMMITTEE**

Address: Parliament of Victoria  
Spring Street  
East Melbourne  
Victoria 3002

Telephone: (03) 8682 2867

Facsimile: (03) 8682 2898

Email: [paec@parliament.vic.gov.au](mailto:paec@parliament.vic.gov.au)

Web: [www.parliament.vic.gov.au/paec](http://www.parliament.vic.gov.au/paec)

**Parliament of Victoria  
Public Accounts and Estimates Committee**

*Report on the 2008-09 Financial and Performance Outcomes*

ISBN 978 0 9806614 6 0

# CONTENTS

---

<b>PUBLIC ACCOUNTS AND ESTIMATES COMMITTEE MEMBERSHIP – 56TH PARLIAMENT .....</b>	<b>xiii</b>
<b>DUTIES OF THE COMMITTEE .....</b>	<b>xv</b>
<b>CHAIR’S FOREWORD .....</b>	<b>xvii</b>
<b>RECOMMENDATIONS .....</b>	<b>xix</b>
<b>CHAPTER 1: INTRODUCTION AND RESPONSES TO THE PREVIOUS FINANCIAL AND PERFORMANCE OUTCOMES REPORT .....</b>	<b>1</b>
1.1. Background.....	1
1.2. Objectives of the Inquiry .....	1
1.3. Scope of the Inquiry .....	2
1.3.1 Coverage of departments and other government agencies.....	3
1.3.2 Analysis of annual reports.....	4
1.4. The review process.....	5
1.4.1 Timeliness of departmental responses .....	6
1.5. Response to the Committee’s Report on the 2007-08 Financial and Performance Outcomes.....	8
1.5.1 Auditor-General’s response .....	8
1.5.2 Government’s response.....	9
1.6. Cost of Inquiry.....	10
<b>CHAPTER 2: 2008-09 FINANCIAL OUTCOMES.....</b>	<b>11</b>
2.1. Introduction .....	12
2.2. Outline of Committee’s commentary on key financial outcomes in 2008-09.....	13
2.3. Summary of consolidated financial result for 2008-09.....	14
2.4. Operating result for 2008-09 in the general government sector .....	16
2.4.1 Overview of the 2008-09 result .....	16
2.4.2 Analysis of the 2008-09 operating surplus in the general government sector .....	18
2.5. State of Victoria Outcome for 2008-09.....	27

2.6.	Capital expenditure and debt movements in 2008-09 in the general government sector .....	29
2.6.1	Movements in net debt – general government sector .....	30
2.6.2	Movements in net debt – non-financial public sector .....	31
<b>CHAPTER 3:</b>	<b>PUBLIC SECTOR INFRASTRUCTURE AND ASSET INVESTMENT .....</b>	<b>33</b>
3.1.	Introduction .....	33
3.2.	Departmental explanations from instances of variations in asset spending against 2008-09 expenditure projections .....	35
3.3.	Major infrastructure projects where actual expenditure varied from estimates for 2008-09 .....	35
3.3.1	Major infrastructure projects with actual expenditure lower than estimated in 2008-09 .....	36
3.3.2	Major infrastructure projects with actual expenditure higher than estimated in 2008-09 .....	62
3.4.	Major infrastructure projects with revised completion dates .....	72
3.5.	Supporting departments' project planning and management .....	85
<b>CHAPTER 4:</b>	<b>REVENUE AND REVENUE FOREGONE .....</b>	<b>87</b>
4.1.	Introduction .....	88
4.2.	Revenue .....	89
4.2.1	Revenue summary .....	89
4.2.2	Revenue – the Government's strategy and outlook for 2008-09 .....	91
4.2.3	Revision to revenue expectations during 2008-09 .....	92
4.2.4	Revenue outcomes for 2008-09 .....	93
4.2.5	Financial Report for the State of Victoria – analysis of end of year revenue outcomes with prior year actuals .....	96
4.2.6	Accuracy of revenue estimation .....	96
4.3.	Revenue foregone .....	97
4.3.1	Tax expenditures managed by the Department of Treasury and Finance .....	97
4.3.2	Direct Concessions and subsidies .....	101
<b>CHAPTER 5:</b>	<b>STAFFING (PUBLIC SECTOR WORKFORCE) .....</b>	<b>111</b>
5.1.	Victorian public sector workforce overview .....	113

5.2.	Staff costs and performance bonuses .....	114
5.2.1	Staff numbers and staff costs in departments.....	114
5.2.2	Staff numbers and staff costs in selected agencies.....	117
5.2.3	Performance bonuses in government departments.....	121
5.2.4	Performance bonuses in selected agencies .....	125
5.2.5	Relationship of bonuses to salaries for departments and selected agencies .....	128
5.3.	Contractors .....	132
5.4.	Sick leave.....	134
5.5.	Succession Planning.....	138
5.5.1	Department of Education and Early Childhood Development.....	138
5.5.2	Department of Human Services.....	139
5.5.3	Department of Innovation, Industry and Regional Development ...	139
5.5.4	Department of Justice .....	140
5.5.5	Department of Planning and Community Development.....	141
5.5.6	Department of Premier and Cabinet .....	142
5.5.7	Department of Primary Industries .....	143
5.5.8	Department of Sustainability and Environment.....	143
5.5.9	Department of Transport.....	144
5.5.10	Department of Treasury and Finance .....	144
5.6.	Professional development of staff.....	145
<b>CHAPTER 6:</b>	<b>PROCUREMENT .....</b>	<b>149</b>
6.1.	Introduction .....	150
6.2.	Background.....	151
6.3.	Securing value for money in procurement .....	153
6.3.1	Criteria for obtaining value for money in procurement.....	153
6.3.2	Overall findings .....	154
6.3.3	Price as a criteria for value for money .....	157
6.4.	Cost versus budget for large procurement contracts .....	157
6.5.	Times involved in implementation .....	160

6.5.1	Criteria for ensuring procurement contracts are delivered on time	160
6.5.2	Overall findings .....	160
6.5.3	Corporate/annual/business planning .....	163
6.6.	Quality of service .....	164
6.6.1	Criteria for maximising quality.....	164
6.6.2	Overall findings .....	164
6.7.	Risk management.....	165
6.7.1	Criteria for managing procurement risk.....	165
6.7.2	Overall findings .....	166
6.7.3	Risks associated with procurement that are critical to the achievement of organisational outcomes .....	166
6.7.4	Monitoring of risks on an ongoing basis.....	167
6.7.5	Risk sharing .....	167
6.8.	Accountability framework.....	167
6.8.1	Criteria for establishing strong accountability for procurement.....	167
6.8.2	Overall findings .....	168
6.8.3	Central level.....	168
6.8.4	Agency level.....	168
<b>CHAPTER 7:</b>	<b>FISCAL STIMULUS PACKAGES AND GRANTS 2008-09 .....</b>	<b>169</b>
7.1.	Introduction .....	170
7.2.	Expenditure achieved by 30 June 2009.....	171
7.3.	Expenditure performance.....	172
7.4.	Risk management processes.....	173
7.5.	Project management skills.....	175
7.6.	Reporting systems .....	176
7.7.	Auditing of the stimulus package .....	177
<b>CHAPTER 8:</b>	<b>STATE DEBT .....</b>	<b>179</b>
8.1.	Introduction .....	180
8.2.	Net debt .....	181
8.3.	General government sector and State of Victoria borrowings .....	183

8.4.	Indicators of financial condition.....	186
8.5.	Management of debt and associated risk .....	187
8.5.1	Debt management strategy.....	187
8.5.2	Risk management.....	188
<b>CHAPTER 9:</b>	<b>VICTORIAN GOVERNMENT RESPONSE TO THE FEBRUARY</b>	
	<b>2009 BUSHFIRES .....</b>	<b>189</b>
9.1.	Background.....	189
9.1.1	Severity of the 2009 bushfires .....	189
9.1.2	Role of the Royal Commission.....	189
9.1.3	Continued interest by the Committee.....	190
9.2.	Introduction .....	192
9.3.	Departmental responses – consolidated summary.....	193
<b>CHAPTER 10:</b>	<b>PORTFOLIO PROGRAM OUTCOMES .....</b>	<b>201</b>
10.1.	Introduction .....	202
10.2.	Background.....	203
10.3.	Good examples of a planned outcome and quantitative data to demonstrate achievement of the outcome.....	204
10.4.	Defining planned outcomes .....	204
10.5.	Achievements compared to planned outcomes .....	206
10.6.	Use of economic indicators to evaluate and report on performance ..	209
<b>CHAPTER 11:</b>	<b>PERFORMANCE TARGETS AND OUTPUT COSTS</b>	
	<b>VARIATIONS .....</b>	<b>211</b>
11.1.	Introduction .....	212
11.2.	Overview .....	212
11.3.	Department of Education and Early Childhood Development .....	219
11.3.1	Output Costs.....	219
11.3.2	Other Output Targets .....	219
11.4.	Department of Human Services.....	220
11.4.1	Output Costs.....	220
11.4.2	Other Output Targets .....	222
11.5.	Department of Innovation, Industry and Regional Development .....	223

11.5.1	Output Costs .....	223
11.5.2	Other Output Targets .....	226
11.6.	Department of Justice .....	231
11.6.1	Output Costs .....	231
11.6.2	Other Output Targets .....	232
11.7.	Department of Planning and Community Development.....	232
11.7.1	Output Costs .....	232
11.7.2	Other Output Targets .....	233
11.8.	Department of Premier and Cabinet .....	234
11.8.1	Output Costs .....	234
11.8.2	Other Output Targets .....	234
11.9.	Department of Primary Industries .....	235
11.9.1	Output Costs .....	235
11.9.2	Other Output Targets .....	235
11.10.	Department of Sustainability and Environment.....	236
11.10.1	Output Costs .....	236
11.10.2	Other Output Targets .....	238
11.11.	Department of Transport .....	238
11.11.1	Output Costs .....	238
11.11.2	Other Output Targets .....	239
11.12.	Department of Treasury and Finance .....	240
11.12.1	Output Costs .....	240
11.12.2	Other Output Targets .....	241
<b>CHAPTER 12:</b>	<b>ENVIRONMENTAL OUTCOMES .....</b>	<b>243</b>
12.1.	Introduction .....	244
12.2.	Financial Reporting Direction 24C .....	244
12.2.1	Energy Use .....	245
12.2.2	Waste Production.....	249
12.2.3	Paper Use .....	253
12.2.4	Water Consumption .....	256



12.2.5	Transportation .....	258
12.2.6	Greenhouse Gas Emissions .....	260
12.2.7	Procurement .....	265
12.3.	Future Targets .....	265
12.4.	Costs/Savings Associated with Environmental Initiatives .....	265
12.5.	Issues in the Reporting of Office-Based Environmental Data by Government Entities .....	266
12.5.1	Compliance .....	266
12.5.2	Data Coverage .....	266
12.5.3	Trend Data .....	267
12.5.4	Significant Variations .....	267
<b>CHAPTER 13: REGIONAL AND RURAL OUTCOMES .....</b>		<b>269</b>
13.1.	Background .....	270
13.2.	Supporting farmers .....	272
13.2.1	Future Farming Strategy .....	272
13.2.1	Drought assistance .....	275
13.1.	Economic development initiatives .....	276
13.1.1	Jobs created in regional Victoria .....	279
13.1.2	Regional Infrastructure Development Fund .....	280
13.1.3	Evaluating Moving Forward: performance measures .....	284
13.2.	Access to cultural programs .....	284
13.3.	Transport Accessibility .....	285
13.4.	Health services .....	287
<b>CHAPTER 14: THRIVING ECONOMY .....</b>		<b>291</b>
14.1.	Introduction .....	292
14.2.	More quality Jobs and thriving, innovative industries across Victoria .....	292
14.2.1	Adapting training to meet changing conditions .....	292
14.2.2	Creating and maintaining jobs to mitigate the effects of the Global Financial Crisis .....	300
14.2.3	Investment facilitation and the Global Financial Crisis .....	301

14.2.4	Assistance for businesses, farms and tourism following the February 2009 Bushfires .....	303
14.2.5	Increasing Victoria's productivity and competitiveness .....	307
14.3.	Growing and Linking All of Victoria .....	311
14.3.1	Growing Victoria's Population .....	311
14.3.2	Rail Services – Workforce Availability and V/Line Services .....	314
14.3.3	Taxis .....	319
<b>CHAPTER 15:</b>	<b>QUALITY HEALTH AND EDUCATION .....</b>	<b>321</b>
15.1.	Introduction .....	322
15.2.	High quality, accessible health and community services .....	322
15.2.1	Responding to alcohol and other drug use concerns – development of action plans and reporting .....	322
15.2.2	Victoria's Cancer Action Plan 2008-11: setting milestones .....	324
15.2.3	Extreme heat events – improving the resilience of Victorian communities .....	326
15.3.	High quality education and training for lifelong learning .....	329
15.3.1	Completion of Year 12 (or its education equivalent) by young people by 2010 .....	329
15.3.2	Early school leavers unemployed after six months .....	332
15.3.3	Year 12 or equivalent programs supported by the Victorian Skills Commission – employment outcomes for students .....	334
15.3.4	Schools where student outcomes were below expected levels .....	336
15.3.5	2009 National Assessment Program – Literacy and Numeracy in Victoria .....	338
<b>CHAPTER 16:</b>	<b>HEALTHY ENVIRONMENT .....</b>	<b>341</b>
16.1.	Introduction .....	342
16.2.	Protecting the Environment for Future Generations .....	342
16.2.1	Effectiveness of Catchment Management Authorities .....	342
16.2.2	Victorian Local Sustainability Accord .....	343
16.3.	Efficient Use of Natural Resources .....	344
16.3.1	Energy Technology Innovation Strategy .....	344
16.3.2	Our Water Our Future Plan .....	347
16.3.3	Natural Resources Investment Program .....	352

16.3.4	Water Recycling - Barwon Water .....	355
16.3.5	Barwon Water Alliance .....	356
<b>CHAPTER 17: CARING COMMUNITIES .....</b>		<b>359</b>
17.1.	Introduction .....	360
17.2.	Building friendly, confident and safe communities .....	360
17.2.1	Keeping young people safe .....	360
17.2.2	Crime and Policing.....	361
17.3.	A fairer society that reduces disadvantage and respects diversity .....	367
17.3.1	Reducing disadvantage in education .....	367
17.3.1	Delivering justice.....	370
17.3.2	Respecting diversity.....	372
<b>CHAPTER 18: VIBRANT DEMOCRACY .....</b>		<b>375</b>
18.1.	Introduction .....	376
18.2.	Greater public participation and more accountable government .....	376
18.2.1	Community Cabinet Program – increasing opportunities for seeking community input .....	376
18.3.	Sound financial management .....	378
18.3.1	Taxation revenue from the sale of Intralot products.....	378
18.3.2	Whole-of-government risk management.....	378
18.3.3	Financial management practices employed to optimise State’s ongoing financial performance.....	380
18.3.4	Indicators of the State’s financial condition.....	382
18.3.5	Development of superannuation liability management initiatives .....	385
18.3.6	Consolidating and rationalising information technology and administrative services across government.....	387
18.4.	Victorian Funds Management Corporation .....	388
18.4.1	Investment performance during 2008-09 against benchmark targets.....	388
<b>CHAPTER 19: REVIEW OF ANNUAL REPORTS OF DEPARTMENTS, AGENCIES AND INDEPENDENT OFFICERS OF PARLIAMENT .....</b>		<b>391</b>
19.1.	Introduction .....	391
19.2.	Review criteria .....	392

19.2.1	Compliance with the Financial Management Act 1994, the Standing Directions and Financial Reporting Directions of the Minister for Finance .....	392
19.2.2	Performance reporting .....	393
19.3.	Summary of findings .....	393
19.3.1	Compliance with the Financial Management Act 1994, Standing Directions and Financial Reporting Directions of the Minister for Finance .....	393
19.3.2	Performance reporting .....	396
19.3.3	Timeliness of reporting.....	397
19.4.	Detailed findings of review .....	397
19.4.1	Departmental annual reports .....	397
19.4.2	Government agencies' annual reports .....	402
19.4.3	Independent Officers of Parliament annual reports .....	404
<b>APPENDIX 1:</b>	<b>DEPARTMENTAL RESPONSES TO THE FEBRUARY 2009 BUSHFIRES .....</b>	<b>407</b>
<b>APPENDIX 2:</b>	<b>PORTFOLIO PROGRAM OUTCOMES .....</b>	<b>431</b>
<b>APPENDIX 3:</b>	<b>ACRONYMS AND ABBREVIATIONS.....</b>	<b>517</b>

# **PUBLIC ACCOUNTS AND ESTIMATES COMMITTEE MEMBERSHIP – 56TH PARLIAMENT**

---

Bob Stensholt MP (Chair)

Kim Wells MP (Deputy Chair)

Richard Dalla-Riva MLC

Judith Graley MP\*

Jennifer Huppert MLC

Wade Noonan MP

Sue Pennicuik MLC

Gordon Rich-Phillips MLC

Robin Scott MP

Bill Sykes MP

\* Judith Graley MP was appointed to the Committee on 2 February 2010 by the Legislative Council following the resignation of Janice Munt MP on 2 February 2010.

For this inquiry, the Committee was supported by a secretariat comprising:

Executive Officer: Valerie Cheong

Senior Research Officer: Christopher Gribbin

Research Officers: Ian Claessen

David Lacy

Julie Gould (temporary)

Consultant: Joe Manders

Business Support Officer: Melanie Hondros

Desktop Publisher: Mitch Marks



## DUTIES OF THE COMMITTEE

---

The Public Accounts and Estimates Committee is a joint parliamentary committee constituted under the *Parliamentary Committees Act 2003*.

The Committee comprises ten members of Parliament drawn from both Houses of Parliament.

The Committee carries out investigations and reports to Parliament on matters associated with the financial management of the State. Its functions under the Act are to inquire into, consider and report to the Parliament on:

- any proposal, matter or thing concerned with public administration or public sector finances;
- the annual estimates or receipts and payments and other Budget Papers and any supplementary estimates of receipts or payments presented to the Assembly and the Council; and
- any proposal, matter or thing that is relevant to its functions and has been referred to the Committee by resolution of the Council or the Assembly or by order of the Governor in Council published in the Government Gazette.

The Committee also has a number of statutory responsibilities in relation to the Office of the Auditor-General. The Committee is required to:

- recommend the appointment of the Auditor-General and the independent performance and financial auditors to review the Victorian Auditor-General's Office;
- consider the budget estimates for the Victorian Auditor-General's Office;
- review the Auditor-General's draft annual plan and, if necessary, provide comments on the plan to the Auditor-General prior to its finalisation and tabling in Parliament;
- have a consultative role in determining the objectives and scope of performance audits by the Auditor-General and identifying any other particular issues that need to be addressed;
- have a consultative role in determining performance audit priorities; and
- exempt, if ever deemed necessary, the Auditor-General from legislative requirements applicable to government agencies on staff employment conditions and financial reporting practices.





## CHAIR'S FOREWORD

---

I am pleased to present the Public Accounts and Estimates Committee's *Report on the 2008-09 Financial and Performance Outcomes*. This report is the culmination of the Committee's inquiry into the financial and performance outcomes achieved by departments and various other government agencies in 2008-09.

This report is the third and final such report of the present committee since its formation in 2007 under the 56th Parliament of Victoria. The present committee has made a number of reforms to this report over the previous three years which it believes have contributed to accountable and transparent government. These changes have included covering a wider range of issues, examining performance outcomes in addition to financial outcomes and examining a range of government agencies as well as departments.

The Committee considers that this inquiry plays an important role in the accountability chain between the Government, the Parliament and the public. In particular, the Committee seeks to link departments' and agencies' reporting to both the Budget process and to Government policy documents, including *Growing Victoria Together* and others outlined in the Government's *Annual Statements of Government Intentions*.

This year, the Committee has made 67 recommendations which are aimed, to a large extent, at enhancing accountability for the achievement of outcomes.

Accountability remains as important as ever in a year that has seen Victoria face difficult economic circumstances, including the Global Financial Crisis and the terrible bushfires of February 2009. The ways that government departments and agencies have responded to these events have been a significant theme in this inquiry.

As an important product of the Committee, I commend this report to all Members of Parliament.

The Parliament is currently considering an historic overhaul of the *Financial Management Act 1994*. As input into this process, the Committee tabled a report titled *New Directions in Accountability: Inquiry into Victoria's Public Finance Practices and Legislation* in June 2009. The Committee continues to take an interest in this matter and anticipates conducting its next inquiry into financial and performance outcomes in the light of any changes to the *Financial Management Act 1994*.

On behalf of the Committee, I would like to express my appreciation to my Parliamentary colleagues on this Committee for their continued commitment and bi-partisan approach, as well as the Committee's Secretariat staff for their work on this report. I wish also to extend the Committee's appreciation to Ministers, departments and agencies for their co-operation in assisting the Committee in this inquiry.



**Bob Stensholt MP**  
**Chair**

